

PILOT'S TALK

Lesson 6. Agree and disagree

Level B - Ryanair fuel Mayday

Вечер, шторм над Шотландией. После двух уходов на второй круг в Prestwick самолёт летит в Edinburgh. Запасной аэродром Manchester отказал, причину не назвал. Второй пилот предлагает сразу объявить Mayday по топливу: тогда Manchester будет обязан принять самолёт. Командир смотрит на критерии. Mayday по топливу объявляют, когда расчётный остаток при посадке на ближайшем аэродроме, где возможна безопасная посадка, будет меньше final reserve. Пилоты спорят: каждый соглашается с частью довода другого и возражает против остального.

В этом уроке

Блок	Тема	Главное
1	Согласиться частично	I agree that ..., but; you're right about ..., however
2	Уступка	although / while; despite / in spite of
3	Довод не доказывает вывод	although / even if; this doesn't mean / show that
4	Что важнее	a more important factor; whereas; only if
5	Изменить мнение	you're right about; I agree now; I had thought ..., but now; the new information shows
6	Всё вместе	спор в кабине

Согласиться частично

1A. В разговоре



Let's declare a Mayday now. Then Manchester will have to accept us.



You're right that with a Mayday they have to accept us. However, under the criteria it isn't an emergency yet. Based on our current estimate, we expect to land at Edinburgh above our final reserve.

1B. Правило

Частичное согласие делит довод собеседника на две части: что принимаешь и с чем не согласен. Для каждой части - своё основание.

Модель	Пример
I agree that + предложение, but + возражение	I agree that a Mayday solves the Manchester problem, but it isn't an emergency yet.
You're right about + существительное. However, + возражение	You're right about Manchester. However, our predicted landing fuel is above the final reserve.

Модель	Пример
You're right that + предложение. However, + возражение	You're right that with a Mayday they have to accept us. However, it isn't an emergency yet.

1C. Обрати внимание: but и however

Связка	Как ставится	Пример
but	внутри одного предложения, после запятой	I agree that it helps, but it isn't an emergency yet.
however	в начале нового предложения, после него запятая	You're right. However, it isn't an emergency yet.

You're right, however it isn't an emergency. [X] - между двумя частями нужна точка или точка с запятой.

1D. Обрати внимание: agree

I agree - я согласен. Без be.

I agree that ... [OK] - **I am agree that ...** [X]

Agree with + человек или мнение: I agree with you. **Agree that + предложение:** I agree that it helps.

1E. Основание для каждой части



You're right that with a Mayday they have to accept us. However, it isn't an emergency yet, **because** we expect to land at Edinburgh above our final reserve.

Based on + источник показывает, на чём держится оценка: **based on our current estimate** - по нашей текущей оценке.

Уступка

2A. В разговоре



Although the wind at Edinburgh is strong, it's still our best option?



Yes. Despite the strong wind, Edinburgh is still our best option. While the wind there is stronger than at Prestwick, Glasgow is reporting windshear on final, and Manchester can't take us.

2B. Правило

Уступка признаёт факт, который говорит против твоей позиции, и сохраняет позицию.

Связка	Что после неё	Пример
although	целое предложение	Although the wind is strong, Edinburgh is still our best option.
while	целое предложение; часто - в сопоставлении	While the wind is stronger there, Edinburgh is still our best option.

Связка	Что после неё	Пример
despite	существительное или -ing	Despite the strong wind, Edinburgh is still our best option.
in spite of	существительное или -ing	In spite of the strong wind, Edinburgh is still our best option.

2С. Обрати внимание: although или despite

После **although** - предложение с личной формой глагола. После **despite** - существительное или форма на **-ing**, а не обычное предложение.

Although the wind **is** strong, ... [OK]

Despite the strong **wind**, ... [OK]

Despite taking extra fuel, we still face a difficult choice. [OK]

Despite the wind is strong, ... [X]

Despite - без of. **In spite of** - с of.

Довод не доказывает вывод

3А. В разговоре



Glasgow is closer than Edinburgh. Let's go there.



Although Glasgow is closer, that doesn't mean it's a better option. They're reporting windshear on final.



Maybe the wind at Glasgow is weaker now.



Even if it's weaker now, that doesn't show that the windshear has gone. They're still reporting it.

3В. Правило

Контраргумент не всегда отвергает факт собеседника. Часто он показывает, что из этого факта не следует вывод.

Модель	Что делает	Пример
This / That doesn't mean that + предложение	факт есть, но вывода из него нет	Glasgow is closer, but that doesn't mean it's a better option.
This / That doesn't show that + предложение	факт не доказывает вывода	That doesn't show that the windshear has gone.

3С. Различие: although и even if

Связка	Что мы думаем о факте	Пример
although	факт верен, мы его признаём	Although Glasgow is closer, ... *(Glasgow действительно ближе)*
even if	допускаем факт, чтобы проверить вывод; верен ли он, не знаем	Even if the wind is weaker now, ... *(может быть, а может, и нет)*

Even if - «даже если». Мы не соглашаемся, что ветер ослаб. Мы показываем, что даже в этом случае вывод не следует.

Что важнее

4А. В разговоре



The wind is a more important factor than the distance. A successful approach at Edinburgh keeps us above our final reserve, whereas Manchester after a go-around means landing below it.



But that estimate assumes we land at Edinburgh. It's true only if one of our approaches works.

4В. Правило

Модель	Что делает	Пример
A more important factor is ... / ... is a more important factor than ...	называет более важный фактор	The wind is a more important factor than the distance.
whereas + предложение	противопоставляет два варианта по одному признаку	Edinburgh keeps us above our final reserve, whereas Manchester means landing below it.
only if + предложение	ограничивает, когда довод верен	Our estimate is true only if one of our approaches works.
because + предложение	объясняет ограничение	It matters because we can't divert safely after a second go-around.

4С. Whereas и but

Связка	Когда выбираем
whereas	два варианта сравниваем по одному признаку: здесь так, а там иначе
but	любое противопоставление, в том числе неожиданный результат

At Edinburgh we land above our final reserve, **whereas** at Manchester we land below it. - Один признак: топливо на посадке.

4D. Only if: где граница довода

Довод верен не всегда, а только при условии. **Only if** называет это условие.



We expect to land at Edinburgh above our final reserve.



That's true **only if** one of our approaches works.

Junior не говорит, что оценка неверна. Она показывает, при каком условии оценка верна.

Изменить мнение

5A. В разговоре



You're right about the estimate: it depends on landing at Edinburgh. I had thought the landing estimate settled the question, but your point about another go-around matters. We need to compare the options before we start.



And I agree now that it isn't an emergency yet. Your point about the criteria is fair.

5B. Правило

Изменить мнение - значит назвать, что ты принимаешь, что думал раньше и что изменило твою позицию.

Шаг	Модель	Пример
Признать	You're right about + существительное; I agree now	You're right about the estimate. I agree now.
Прежнее и новое мнение	I had thought ... / I thought ..., but now ...	I had thought the landing estimate settled the question, but your point about another go-around matters.
Что изменило мнение	your point about + существительное; the new information shows that ...; because ...	Your point about the criteria is fair.

5C. I thought и I had thought

Модель	Оттенок
I thought the estimate settled the question, but now ...	Прежнее мнение. Этого достаточно.
I had thought the estimate settled the question, but ...	Подчеркивает прежнее представление, которое говорящий теперь пересматривает.

I had thought - форма Past Perfect: had + V3.

5D. Новая информация

The new weather information shows that the wind at Edinburgh is even stronger than at Prestwick.



I had thought Edinburgh was a calmer option, but the new weather information shows that the wind there is even stronger. It's still our best option, but we need a plan for Manchester.

Изменить мнение можно и частично: принять одну часть довода и сохранить решение.

Всё вместе: спор в кабине



Let's declare a Mayday now. Then Manchester will have to accept us.



You're right that with a Mayday they have to accept us. However, under the criteria it isn't an emergency yet. Based on our current estimate, we expect to land at Edinburgh above our final reserve.



Glasgow is closer, though.



Although Glasgow is closer, that doesn't mean it's a better option. They're reporting windshear on final. The wind is a more important factor than the distance.



But our estimate is true only if one of our approaches at Edinburgh works.



You're right about that. I had thought the landing estimate settled the question, but your point about another go-around matters. We need to compare the options before we start.



And I agree now that it isn't an emergency yet.

Что делаем	Модель
Соглашаемся частично	You're right that However, ...
Признаём факт и сохраняем позицию	although; despite
Показываем, что вывод не следует	that doesn't mean that ...
Называем более важный фактор	a more important factor
Показываем границу довода	only if
Меняем мнение	You're right about ...; I had thought ..., but your point about ... matters

Practice

Говори то от лица командира, то от лица второго пилота. В каждом пункте заполни пропуск в реплике того, у кого он стоит, используя слова под диалогом. Глаголы и прилагательные даны в начальной форме: поставь их в нужную форму. Остальная часть реплики уже дана.

Короткие разговоры по темам. Каждое задание - отдельный разговор в кабине.

Опора: неправильные глаголы в упражнениях

Начальная форма	Past Simple	V3
to be	was / were	been
to come	came	come
to have	had	had
to think	thought	thought

Карта упражнений

Задание	Тема	Блок
6.1	Согласиться частично	1
6.2	Уступка	2
6.3	Довод не доказывает вывод	3
6.4	Что важнее	4
6.5	Изменить мнение	5
6.6	Всё вместе	1-6

6.1. Согласиться частично

Блок 1 · I agree that ..., but; you're right about / that ..., however; because; agree with

1.



A Mayday would make Manchester accept us.



Manchester / but / not / our situation / that / a Mayday / to accept / yet / to meet / to do / to agree / the criteria / to have / I

2.



We have the extra fuel from Pisa, so we're fine.



to cost / you / a lot of it / about the extra fuel / to be / right / two go-arounds / however

3.



Edinburgh has a strong wind.



Glasgow / right / that / to be / strong / to be / however / it / on final / you / windshear / to have

4.



So you don't want a Mayday at all?



our estimate for Edinburgh / because / not yet / us / above the final reserve / to keep

5.



I think we should keep Manchester as a backup.



first / to agree / but / they / to accept / with you / I / us / to have

6.



The second approach at Prestwick was a reasonable decision. The other crew landed.



to be / that / to come / the warning / it / I / again / reasonable / but / to agree

7.



The office can help us with Manchester.



still / however / to know / to do / you / right / the reason / not / about the office / to be / they

8.



With a Mayday, ATC gives us priority.



to agree / we / to need / I / that / not / yet / we / to get / priority / it / with a Mayday / but / to do

6.2. Уступка

Блок 2 · although / while; despite / in spite of

1.



The wind at Edinburgh is stronger than at Prestwick.



we / to have / to be / there / it / two chances / although / strong / still

2.



Edinburgh is still our best option.



the gusts / I / to agree / despite

3.



Should we change our plan?



I / to work / to think / the delay / the plan / in spite of / still

4.



Glasgow is closer.



me / more / its windshear reports / to be / Glasgow / while / to worry / close

5.



We took extra fuel in Pisa. Aren't we safe?



careful / to take / despite / we / to have / extra fuel / now / to be

6.



The approach at Edinburgh will be difficult.



it / it / although / the right choice / difficult / to be / to be

7.



Manchester is still saying no.



may / their refusal / still / to be / an option / later / Manchester / in spite of

6.3. Довод не доказывает вывод

Блок 3 · although / even if; this doesn't mean / show that

1.



The other crew landed at Prestwick. Maybe it isn't so bad.



to be / that / good / not / the conditions / to do / to mean

2.



Manchester took other diversions tonight, so they have space.



they / that / not / space / to do / to have / that / to show / right now

3.



Maybe Manchester will change their mind.



it / still / with enough fuel / they / to change / even if / there / to have / to get / we

4.



We know Prestwick well.



back there / to go / we / not / we / well / it / to know / although / can

5.



The wind at Edinburgh is from the same direction as at Prestwick.



that / to mean / even if / the same / to be / the same / to be / not / the direction / to do / the conditions

6.



We have 1,322 kg of extra fuel from Pisa.



to have / that / still / we / not / to mean / all of it / to do

7.



If Glasgow stops reporting windshear, let's go there.



to do / calm / to show / it / the air / that / even if / that / to be / not / to stop

8.



Edinburgh is our best option.



an easy one / although / to be / our best option / to be / not / it / it

6.4. Что важнее

Блок 4 · a more important factor; whereas; only if; because

1.



Glasgow is closer, so it's better.



to be / than a few miles / a more important factor / their windshear reports

2.



What's the difference between the two options?



a long flight / Manchester / with little fuel / one good approach / to need / to need / Edinburgh / whereas

3.



We'll land at Edinburgh above our final reserve.



on the first or second approach / only if / we / to land

4.



Why does that limit matter?



two go-arounds there / to divert / because / too little fuel / to leave

5.



Manchester is our planned alternate.



to be / than our plan / our fuel / a more important factor / now

6.



Both options have risks.



whereas / the fuel / Edinburgh's risk / Manchester's risk / to be / the wind / to be

7.



So Manchester is out completely?



an option / it / only if / to be / our fuel / it / to allow / and / to accept / us / they

6.5. Изменить мнение

Блок 5 · you're right about; I agree now; I thought / I had thought ..., but now; your point about; the new information shows

1.



Our estimate depends on landing at Edinburgh.



too / let's / right / a plan / about that / you / to be / for Manchester / to prepare

2.



Under the criteria, it isn't an emergency yet.



to agree / to be / now / only at Manchester / I / I / to look

3.



Does the Mayday still seem urgent to you?



to think / we / I / not / we / to need / it / at once / but now / I / to see / to do

4.



Did the Edinburgh wind surprise you?



to move / I / away / the storm / 46 knots / the gusts there / to be / still / but / to be / to have / to think

5.



Remember, we can't divert safely after a second go-around there.



about the second go-around / your point / important / to be

6.



Has anything changed?



to show / the new information / Glasgow / that / still / to have / windshear

7.



Why did you change your mind?



me / because / you / to show / of our estimate / the limit

8.



So you've changed your view on Glasgow?



Yes. _____

to see / but now / I / to have / the easier option / the windshear risk / to be / it / to think / I

6.6. Всё вместе

Блоки 1-5 · спор в кабине

1.



Let's call a Mayday and go to Manchester.



it / not / to be / us / into Manchester / but / to agree / that / a Mayday / to get / the right time / I / yet

2.



Edinburgh keeps us above our final reserve.



to work / only if / one of our two approaches

3.



Then let's divert to Glasgow.



the windshear there / me / to be / more / to worry / close / it / although

4.



Glasgow's windshear might stop soon.



that / it / to stop / to mean / to be / will / even if / the approach / not / easy / to do

5.



So what matters most?



a more important factor / to be / the fuel at landing / than the flying time

6.



Our estimate only works if we land at Edinburgh.



the estimate / I / we / you / to think / right / enough / to be / I / a backup / to need / to be / but now / to agree

7.



So, no Mayday for now?



to agree / I / at first / I / to think / although / now / differently

Answer key

These are model answers. Correct alternatives are possible.

6.1. Сogласиться частично

1.



A Mayday would make Manchester accept us.



I agree that Manchester has to accept a Mayday, but our situation doesn't meet the criteria yet.

2.



We have the extra fuel from Pisa, so we're fine.



You're right about the extra fuel. However, two go-arounds cost a lot of it.

3.



Edinburgh has a strong wind.



You're right that it's strong. However, Glasgow has windshear on final.

4.



So you don't want a Mayday at all?



Not yet, because our estimate for Edinburgh keeps us above the final reserve.

5.



I think we should keep Manchester as a backup.



I agree with you, but they have to accept us first.

6.



The second approach at Prestwick was a reasonable decision. The other crew landed.



I agree that it was reasonable, but the warning came again.

7.



The office can help us with Manchester.



You're right about the office. However, they still don't know the reason.

8.



With a Mayday, ATC gives us priority.



I agree that we get priority with a Mayday, but we don't need it yet.

6.2. Уступка

1.



The wind at Edinburgh is stronger than at Prestwick.



Although it's stronger, we still have two chances there.

2.



Edinburgh is still our best option.



Despite the gusts, I agree.

3.



Should we change our plan?



In spite of the delay, I think the plan still works.

4.



Glasgow is closer.



While Glasgow is closer, its windshear reports worry me more.

5.



We took extra fuel in Pisa. Aren't we safe?



Despite taking extra fuel, we have to be careful now.

6.



The approach at Edinburgh will be difficult.



Although it's difficult, it's the right choice.

7.



Manchester is still saying no.



In spite of their refusal, Manchester may still be an option later.

6.3. Довод не доказывает вывод

1.



The other crew landed at Prestwick. Maybe it isn't so bad.



That doesn't mean the conditions are good.

2.



Manchester took other diversions tonight, so they have space.



That doesn't show that they have space right now.

3.



Maybe Manchester will change their mind.



Even if they change it, we still have to get there with enough fuel.

4.



We know Prestwick well.



Although we know it well, we can't go back there.

5.



The wind at Edinburgh is from the same direction as at Prestwick.



Even if the direction is the same, that doesn't mean the conditions are the same.

6.



We have 1,322 kg of extra fuel from Pisa.



That doesn't mean we still have all of it.

7.



If Glasgow stops reporting windshear, let's go there.



Even if it stops, that doesn't show that the air is calm.

8.



Edinburgh is our best option.



Although it's our best option, it isn't an easy one.

6.4. Что важнее

1.



Glasgow is closer, so it's better.



Their windshear reports are a more important factor than a few miles.

2.



What's the difference between the two options?



Edinburgh needs one good approach, whereas Manchester needs a long flight with little fuel.

3.



We'll land at Edinburgh above our final reserve.



Only if we land on the first or second approach.

4.



Why does that limit matter?



Because two go-arounds there leave too little fuel to divert.

5.



Manchester is our planned alternate.



Our fuel is a more important factor now than our plan.

6.



Both options have risks.



Edinburgh's risk is the wind, whereas Manchester's risk is the fuel.

7.



So Manchester is out completely?



It's an option only if they accept us and our fuel allows it.

6.5. Изменить мнение

1.



Our estimate depends on landing at Edinburgh.



You're right about that. Let's prepare a plan for Manchester too.

2.



Under the criteria, it isn't an emergency yet.



I agree now. I was looking only at Manchester.

3.



Does the Mayday still seem urgent to you?



I thought we needed it at once, but now I see we don't.

4.



Did the Edinburgh wind surprise you?



I had thought the storm was moving away, but the gusts there are still 46 knots.

5.



Remember, we can't divert safely after a second go-around there.



Your point about the second go-around is important.

6.



Has anything changed?



The new information shows that Glasgow still has windshear.

7.



Why did you change your mind?



Because you showed me the limit of our estimate.

8.



So you've changed your view on Glasgow?



Yes. **I had thought it was the easier option, but now I see the windshear risk.**

6.6. Всё вместе

1.



Let's call a Mayday and go to Manchester.



I agree that a Mayday gets us into Manchester, but it isn't the right time yet.

2.



Edinburgh keeps us above our final reserve.



Only if one of our two approaches works.

3.



Then let's divert to Glasgow.



Although it's closer, the windshear there worries me more.

4.



Glasgow's windshear might stop soon.



Even if it stops, that doesn't mean the approach will be easy.

5.



So what matters most?



The fuel at landing is a more important factor than the flying time.

6.



Our estimate only works if we land at Edinburgh.



You're right. I thought the estimate was enough, but now I agree we need a backup.

7.



So, no Mayday for now?



I agree now, although I thought differently at first.